



## Comparing Economic Systems

by Kathy Thiebes

*Every society operates with a mixed economic system, combining the influences of market and command models in order to form a functioning economy and government. Individual countries have unique economic systems that are each defined by how they prioritize different economic goals. There are two central Oregon social studies content standards addressed in this module: evaluate different economic systems, comparing advantages and disadvantages of each; and compare and contrast the allocation of goods and services in market and command economies. Before the module, students have learned basic information on taxes as well as the definitions of the various economic systems. This module is taught in a classroom with learners of diverse skill levels including Advanced Placement students, English Language Learners, and students with IEPs. Students keep all texts and their Writer's Notebook (see resources) in a portfolio to help students stay organized and support the teacher in providing efficient feedback.*

**Grades:** 11 12

**Discipline:** Social Studies

**Teaching Task:** Task Template 4 (Argumentation and Comparison)

**Course:** Economics

**Author Information:**

Kathy Thiebes (LDC)

Social Studies Teacher and R-Coach

---



*Section 1: What Task?***TEACHING TASK***Task Template 4 — [1 Level]**Argumentation & Comparison*

**L1:** What are the features of an ideal mixed economy? After reading informational texts, editorials, and an interactive infographic write an essay for the school newspaper that compares the characteristics of market and command economies and argues what combination of characteristics would be most effective for the United States today . Be sure to support your position with evidence from the texts.

---

**STUDENT BACKGROUND**

Every society operates with a mixed economic system, combining the influences of market and command models in order to form a functioning economy and government. Individual countries have unique combinations of the market and command influences depending on how countries prioritize different economic goals. Throughout this module, you will build a portfolio of your reading and writing work that will support you in writing your final essay in response to the task.

**EXTENSION**

Students participate in a formal class debate about the future of America's economic system using their essays and other research to defend their market and command preferences on different topics (healthcare, welfare, education, taxes, etc.).

Rubric							
Scoring Elements	Not Yet		Approaches Expectations		Meets Expectations		Advanced
	1	1.5	2	2.5	3	3.5	4
<b>Focus</b>	Attempts to address prompt, but lacks focus or is off-task.		Addresses prompt appropriately and establishes a position, but focus is uneven.		Addresses prompt appropriately and maintains a clear, steady focus. Provides a generally convincing position.		Addresses all aspects of prompt appropriately with a consistently strong focus and convincing position.
<b>Controlling Idea</b>	Attempts to establish a claim, but lacks a clear purpose. (L2) Makes no mention of counter claims.		Establishes a claim. (L2) Makes note of counter claims.		Establishes a credible claim. (L2) Develops claim and counter claims fairly.		Establishes and maintains a substantive and credible claim or proposal. (L2) Develops claims and counter claims fairly and thoroughly.
<b>Reading/Research</b>	Attempts to reference reading materials to develop response, but lacks connections or relevance to the purpose of the prompt.		Presents information from reading materials relevant to the purpose of the prompt with minor lapses in accuracy or completeness.		Accurately presents details from reading materials relevant to the purpose of the prompt to develop argument or claim.		Accurately and effectively presents important details from reading materials to develop argument or claim.
<b>Development</b>	Attempts to provide details in response to the prompt, but lacks sufficient development or relevance to the purpose of the prompt. (L3) Makes no connections or a connection that is irrelevant to argument or claim.		Presents appropriate details to support and develop the focus, controlling idea, or claim, with minor lapses in the reasoning, examples, or explanations. (L3) Makes a connection with a weak or unclear relationship to argument or claim.		Presents appropriate and sufficient details to support and develop the focus, controlling idea, or claim. (L3) Makes a relevant connection to clarify argument or claim.		Presents thorough and detailed information to effectively support and develop the focus, controlling idea, or claim. (L3) Makes a clarifying connection(s) that illuminates argument and adds depth to reasoning.
<b>Organization</b>	Attempts to organize ideas, but lacks control of structure.		Uses an appropriate organizational structure for development of reasoning and logic, with minor lapses in structure and/or coherence.		Maintains an appropriate organizational structure to address specific requirements of the prompt. Structure reveals the reasoning and logic of the argument.		Maintains an organizational structure that intentionally and effectively enhances the presentation of information as required by the specific prompt. Structure enhances development of the reasoning and logic of the argument.
							Demonstrates

<p><b>Conventions</b></p>	<p>Attempts to demonstrate standard English conventions, but lacks cohesion and control of grammar, usage, and mechanics. Sources are used without citation.</p>		<p>Demonstrates an uneven command of standard English conventions and cohesion. Uses language and tone with some inaccurate, inappropriate, or uneven features. Inconsistently cites sources.</p>		<p>Demonstrates a command of standard English conventions and cohesion, with few errors. Response includes language and tone appropriate to the audience, purpose, and specific requirements of the prompt. Cites sources using appropriate format with only minor errors.</p>	<p>and maintains a well-developed command of standard English conventions and cohesion, with few errors. Response includes language and tone consistently appropriate to the audience, purpose, and specific requirements of the prompt. Consistently cites sources using appropriate format.</p>
<p><b>Content Understanding</b></p>	<p>Attempts to include disciplinary content in argument, but understanding of content is weak; content is irrelevant, inappropriate, or inaccurate.</p>		<p>Briefly notes disciplinary content relevant to the prompt; shows basic or uneven understanding of content; minor errors in explanation.</p>		<p>Accurately presents disciplinary content relevant to the prompt with sufficient explanations that demonstrate understanding.</p>	<p>Integrates relevant and accurate disciplinary content with thorough explanations that demonstrate in-depth understanding.</p>

## STANDARDS

*Common Core Anchor Standards — Reading*

**R.CCR.1:** Read closely to determine what the text says explicitly and to make logical inferences from it; cite specific textual evidence when writing or speaking to support conclusions drawn from the text.

---

**R.CCR.2:** Determine central ideas or themes of a text and analyze their development; summarize the key supporting details and ideas.

---

**R.CCR.4:** Interpret words and phrases as they are used in a text, including determining technical, connotative, and figurative meanings, and analyze how specific word choices shape meaning or tone.

---

**R.CCR.7:** Integrate and evaluate content presented in diverse media and formats, including visually and quantitatively, as well as in words.

---

**R.CCR.8:** Delineate and evaluate the argument and specific claims in a text, including the validity of the reasoning as well as the relevance and sufficiency of the evidence.

---

**R.CCR.9:** Analyze how two or more texts address similar themes or topics in order to build knowledge or to compare the approaches the authors take.

---

**R.CCR.10:** Read and comprehend complex literary and informational texts independently and proficiently.

---

*Common Core Anchor Standards — Writing*

**W.CCR.1:** Write arguments to support claims in an analysis of substantive topics or texts, using valid reasoning and relevant and sufficient evidence.

---

**W.CCR.4:** Produce clear and coherent writing in which the development, organization, and style are appropriate to task, purpose, and audience.

---

**W.CCR.5:** Develop and strengthen writing as needed by planning, revising, editing, rewriting, or trying a new approach.

---

**W.CCR.8:** Gather relevant information from multiple print and digital sources, assess the credibility and accuracy of each source, and integrate the information while avoiding plagiarism.

---

**W.CCR.9:** Draw evidence from literary or informational texts to support analysis, reflection,

and research.

---

**W.CCR.10:** Write routinely over extended time frames (time for research, reflection, and revision) and shorter time frames (a single sitting or a day or two) for a range of tasks, purposes, and audiences.

---

### *Common Core Anchor Standards — Language*

**L.CCR.1:** Demonstrate command of the conventions of standard English grammar and usage when writing or speaking.

---

**L.CCR.2:** Demonstrate command of the conventions of standard English capitalization, punctuation, and spelling when writing.

---

**L.CCR.4:** Determine or clarify the meaning of unknown and multiple-meaning words and phrases by using context clues, analyzing meaningful word parts, and consulting general and specialized reference materials, as appropriate.

---

### *Common Core Anchor Standards — Speaking and Listening*

**SL.CCR.1:** Prepare for and participate effectively in a range of conversations and collaborations with diverse partners, building on others' ideas and expressing their own clearly and persuasively.

---

### *Custom Standards*

**OREGON STATE CONTENT STANDARD: SS.HS.EC.02.01 :** Compare and contrast the allocation of goods and services in market and command economies.

---

**OREGON STATE CONTENT STANDARD: SS.HS.EC.04 :** Evaluate different economic systems, comparing advantages and disadvantages of each.

---

## Section 2: What Skills?

### Selected Skills

#### *Preparing for the Task*

**TASK ENGAGEMENT:** Ability to discuss with others and use prior knowledge to connect with concepts being introduced in this module SL 11-12.1 & RH 11-12.2

---

**TASK ANALYSIS AND RUBRIC ANALYSIS:** Ability to understand and explain the task's prompt and rubric. SL 11-12.1 & RH 11-12.2

---

#### *Reading Process*

**READING STRATEGIES:** Ability to determine the meaning of words and phrases as they are used in a text. RH 11-12.4

---

**ACTIVE READING:** Ability to: \* Read purposefully and determine the central ideas of a secondary source and provide an accurate summary that makes clear the relationships among the key details and ideas. RH 11-12.2 \* Cite specific textual evidence to support analysis of secondary sources, connecting insights gained from specific details to an understanding of the text as a whole. RH 11-12.1 \* Evaluate an author's premises, claims, and evidence by corroborating or challenging them with other information. RH 11-12.8

---

**NOTE-TAKING:** Ability to: \* Gather relevant information from multiple print and digital sources, assess the credibility and accuracy of each source, and integrate the information while avoiding plagiarism. WH 11-12.8 \* Draw evidence from literary or informational texts to support analysis, reflection, and research. WH 11-12.9

---

**ORGANIZING NOTES:** Ability to: \* Integrate and evaluate content presented in diverse media and formats, including visually and quantitatively, as well as in words. RH 11-12.7 \* Integrate information from diverse sources, both primary and secondary, into a coherent understanding of an idea or event, noting discrepancies among sources. RH 11-12.8

---

#### *Transition to Writing*

**BRIDGING CONVERSATION:** Ability to: \* Explain the rubric and begin linking reading, notes, and discussion to writing task. RH 11-12.1 \* Engage in meaningful discussion by posing and responding to guiding questions and responding thoughtfully to diverse perspectives. Synthesize comments, claims and evidence made on all sides of an issue SL 11-12. 1c/d

---



## *Writing Process*

**ESTABLISHING A CLAIM:** Ability to establish a formal claim in response to the task. WH 11-12.1

---

**OUTLINE:** Ability to create a logical organization of main points and evidence in an outline format. WH 11-12.1

---

**DEVELOPMENT:** Ability to: \* Write arguments to support claims and address counterclaims in an analysis of the topic/texts using valid reasoning and relevant and sufficient evidence. WH 11-12.1 \* Produce clear and coherent writing in which the development, organization, and style are appropriate to task, purpose, and audience. WH 11-12.4 \* Write routinely over an extended time frame. WH 11-12.10

---

**REVISION & EDITING:** Ability to develop and strengthen writing as needed by planning, revising, editing, rewriting, or trying a new approach. WH 11-12.5

---

**COMPLETION:** Ability to submit final piece that meets expectations.

---

## Section 3: What Instruction?

### MiniTasks

#### *Preparing for the Task*

**TASK ENGAGEMENT:** Ability to discuss with others and use prior knowledge to connect with concepts being introduced in this module SL 11-12.1 & RH 11-12.2

#### **SHORT CONSTRUCTED RESPONSE**

Read the following opening question and respond in your journal: : “What would be the positive and negative effects if Oregon chose to eliminate public schools in favor of an all-private system?”

Using a fishbowl discussion format, elaborate on your views and the views of your classmates in response to the journal question.

Read the task. In a quick-write, what is your first reaction to the prompt?

---

**Pacing:** 1 class period (55 min)

---

#### **Scoring Guide: work meets expectations if:**

Meets expectations if students respond to the journal question, take appropriate notes on fishbowl discussion, and produce a quick write in response to the task.

---

#### **Teaching Strategies:**

- Opener - students will complete response the the opening journal question independently.
  - Fishbowl – After the completing the opening journal question independently, students will engage in a short fishbowl discussion to help shape their individual views on the concept of market and command economies in relationship to the opening question. \*\* Note: A fishbowl is similar to a socratic seminar. In order to have a successful shortened fishbowl discussion, students must have experience with the fishbowl routine.
  - After the fishbowl, students read the task and complete the quick-write in their writer's notebook independently (no discussion).
- 

#### **Accomodations and Interventions:**

Provide students with sentence starters and frameworks for their quick-writes.

Example: I believe a \_\_\_\_\_ system would be the best type of system because

\_\_\_\_\_.

---

**TASK ANALYSIS AND RUBRIC ANALYSIS:** Ability to understand and explain the task's prompt and rubric. SL 11-12.1 & RH 11-12.2

---

## SHORT CONSTRUCTED RESPONSE

### TASK BREAKDOWN:

In your own words, break down each piece of the task to develop a deeper understanding of the expectations.

---

**Pacing:** 2 class periods

---

### Scoring Guide: work meets expectations if:

Meets expectations if students participate in discussion and record details of task in their Writer's Notebook.

---

### Teaching Strategies:

- Task Breakdown - Students breakdown each piece of the rubric in their own words in their Writer's Notebook. Share breakdown as a class and create a set of class notes that identify expectations for the task.
- 

### Notes:

Teacher should review student responses in task analysis to ensure they understand the task and identify those who need more support. During the Task Breakdown activity while the class shares their work out loud, encourage them to get as detailed as possible (i.e. What is an essay? How long should it be? What exactly does "evidence" include?).

---

### Accommodations and Interventions:

Specifically organize groups to provide ideal peer-support for students who need it.

---

## NOTES

### RUBRIC ANALYSIS:

In small groups, translate your assigned rubric category into your own words, provide an example of how it would look in an essay, and draw a visual representation.

---

**Pacing:** 1 day

---

### Scoring Guide: work meets expectations if:

Meets expectations if students participate in creation of poster and complete the rubric translation form in their Writer's Notebook. Posters must include:

- A translation of the rubric category in their own words.
  - Examples of what it might look like in an essay.
  - A visual representation of the rubric category.
- 

### Teaching Strategies:

- Introduce rubric to class. Give students 5 minutes to skim the rubric. Ask what they

notice and how it is different or similar to rubrics they have seen in the past.

- Model a translation of one category of the rubric for the class.
- Assign a different category of the rubric to small groups within the class. All groups will be working with just the level 4 (advanced) for each rubric category. Small groups will create a poster for the category using expectations (above).
- Students will do a gallery walk and take notes on each other's rubric translations on the rubric translation sheet in their Writer's Notebook.

---

**Accommodations and Interventions:**

Specifically organize groups to provide ideal peer-support for students who need it.

---

## *Reading Process*

**READING STRATEGIES:** Ability to determine the meaning of words and phrases as they are used in a text. RH 11-12.4

### **LIST**

What strategies do you use to help you process your reading and support learning of new vocabulary?

---

**Pacing:** 1/2 class period (20-30 min)

---

### **Scoring Guide: work meets expectations if:**

List of 5-6 of strategies for reading and understanding difficult vocabulary within texts (can be strategies of others as well).

Participates in practice activities and class discussion of reading strategies.

---

### **Teaching Strategies:**

As individuals, students write down 1 or 2 strategies that they use to help them understand what they read. Students share responses in pairs then must find 3 other strategy ideas from classmates to add to their lists ("give one, get one" activity)

Create a class list of reading strategies.

Teacher models strategies that will be used in throughout the reading process of the module (modeling, note-taking strategies, etc.)

Students practice reading strategies with a variety of small pieces of texts provided by the teacher to ensure everyone is comfortable using the strategies independently.

---

### **Accommodations and Interventions:**

Create bookmarks or laminated cards of reading strategies so students have consistent reminders of strategies.

Advanced students: Use very challenging/high level texts for students to practice

their reading strategies (an excerpt from a college textbook or challenging primary source).

---

**ACTIVE READING:** Ability to: \* Read purposefully and determine the central ideas of a secondary source and provide an accurate summary that makes clear the relationships among the key details and ideas. RH 11-12.2 \* Cite specific textual evidence to support analysis of secondary sources, connecting insights gained from specific details to an understanding of the text as a whole. RH 11-12.1 \* Evaluate an author's premises, claims, and evidence by corroborating or challenging them with other information. RH 11-12.8

### NOTES

Use annotation techniques and other reading strategies to demonstrate your reading process and your level of interaction with the text.

---

**Pacing:** 3-4 class periods (done in conjunction with the Note-Taking Skill for each text)

---

### Scoring Guide: work meets expectations if:

- Annotated or “actively read” article has a variety of marks (circles, underlining, stars, highlights, etc.) and written questions, connections, and insights in the margins that are specific to answering the teaching task.
  - Use annotation rubric to provide students feedback on their reading.
- 

### Teaching Strategies:

- Frontload vocabulary synonyms for market and command economies. Students record in Vocabulary Notes section of their Writer's Notebook. Introduce 2 synonyms each day (i.e. privatized, socialized, free-market, public, etc.)
- Instruction for the first article (“Should the U.S. have a National Healthcare System?”) should be very explicit and include group/partner work and teacher modeling.
  - \* Teacher reads first 3 sentences of the article, modeling active reading strategies using smartboard.
  - \* Students finish reading the rest of the article using a “think aloud” process with a partner.
  - \* Teacher asks for a list of vocabulary that students struggled with and class discusses strategies for understanding words in context. Students record new vocabulary in the Vocabulary Notes section of their Writer's Notebook.
  - \* Students will take notes after reading the article (see note-taking skill).
- Students actively read and annotate the next 3 texts with a gradual release of peer

and teacher support (students should read last two texts independently with minimal small group and class discussion).

---

**Notes:**

One text is an interactive infographic. Spend time discussing how to read data and the importance of evaluating the source and comparison of data.

Recommended order for texts:

- 1) "Should the U.S. have a National Healthcare System?"
  - 2) "As Cuba gives Capitalism a try, Experts Ponder the Future."
  - 3) "Denmark Thrives Despite High Taxes."
  - 4) "The World's Best Countries" Infographic
  - 5) "Wal-Mart: Good or Evil. "
  - 6) "Should the Government Tax Your Coke"
  - 7) "Start-Ups, Not Bailouts."
- 

**Accommodations and Interventions:**

- Modified texts for some students: smaller chunks of text, larger font, pre-highlighted key terms, etc.
  - Some vocabulary pre-defined on modified texts
  - Sentence frames for "think alouds"
  - Advanced Students: Texts #6 and #7 can be included for higher skill level students and/or classes.
- 

**NOTE-TAKING:** Ability to: \* Gather relevant information from multiple print and digital sources, assess the credibility and accuracy of each source, and integrate the information while avoiding plagiarism. WH 11-12.8 \* Draw evidence from literary or informational texts to support analysis, reflection, and research. WH 11-12.9

**NOTES**

In your Writer's Notebook, record evidence from the text that supports the teaching task. Be sure to include the central ideas, quotes, statistics, key words, and phrases that will help you analyze the text and further define your argument in response to the task.

---

**Pacing:** 3-4 class periods (done in conjunction with Active Reading Skill for each text)

---

**Scoring Guide: work meets expectations if:**

Summaries contain central ideas of the texts and include sufficient evidence from the texts that support each economic system philosophy (market and command characteristics).

---

**Teaching Strategies:**

Brief review of summary writing strategies.

Use a variety of reading/writing activities to help students improve processing skills of main idea and significance. Examples:

\* 25 word summary - Ask students to actively read the text independently. When finished, organize students in groups no larger than 4. Groups will write a 25 word summary of the text and read the summary aloud or share on poster paper. Class votes for best summary.

\* Super Six - As students read the text, ask them to identify the 6 words from the text that most exemplify the central idea the author is trying to convey. Place students in small groups and using their individual lists of 6 words, together to create a group list of 6 words. The group must then write a summary of the text using those 6 words.

\* Guide group and partner discussions to evaluate each text including the author's perspective and its validity as well as emerging opinions of students.

---

**Accommodations and Interventions:**

- Provide partners that are supportive for students who need additional guidance.
  - For students who need accommodations, highlight several pieces of the text and ask students to identify which piece of highlighted text most represents the main idea and why.
  - Students can verbally identify examples from the text that support each perspective (market/command) and have teacher or another student record responses.
  - Supply sentence frames to help students begin note-taking on each text.
  - Advanced Students: Limit the supports in the Writer's Notebook by eliminating the note-taking template, encouraging students to define their own effective note-taking strategies.
- 

---

**ORGANIZING NOTES:** Ability to: \* Integrate and evaluate content presented in diverse media and formats, including visually and quantitatively, as well as in words. RH 11-12.7 \* Integrate information from diverse sources, both primary and secondary, into a coherent understanding of an idea or event, noting discrepancies among sources. RH 11-12.8

**LIST**

Prioritize relevant information in the "organizing notes" section of your Writer's Notebook.

---

**Pacing:** 1 class period (55 min)

---

**Scoring Guide: work meets expectations if:**

- Creates a prioritized set of notes that categorizes evidence in a T-Chart format.
- Identifies the texts and key evidence from the texts that support the main categories they have developed for organizing the information.

**Teaching Strategies:**

- Students place relevant information from the texts and their own background knowledge into the graphic organizer in the Writer's Notebook. Encourage students to use notes from previous lectures (7 goals of any economic system).
- As a class, share categories students came up with.
- Students will prioritize the information in the graphic organizer by identifying which pieces of evidence they will use in their essay.

**Notes:**

Prompt students by asking what themes emerged in the texts? What themes could they use to narrow the information from the texts?

**Accommodations and Interventions:**

Provide students with specific examples of what kinds of information belongs in each section of the graphic organizer. Create a list of text-dependent questions to help guide students in the process. Example: "What is one fact you learned from the healthcare article that supports a market system?"

Can also provide students with a pre-developed list of possible categories (healthcare, freedom, security, etc.)

*Transition to Writing*

**BRIDGING CONVERSATION:** Ability to: \* Explain the rubric and begin linking reading, notes, and discussion to writing task. RH 11-12.1 \* Engage in meaningful discussion by posing and responding to guiding questions and responding thoughtfully to diverse perspectives. Synthesize comments, claims and evidence made on all sides of an issueSL 11-12. 1c/d

**SHORT CONSTRUCTED RESPONSE**

Silent Conversation

Engage in a "silent" class discussion about the task using various guiding questions.

**Pacing:** 1/2 class period (20-30 min)

**Scoring Guide: work meets expectations if:**

Students take appropriate notes on silent conversation and participate in all-class



discussion and debate.

---

**Teaching Strategies:**

Place a large piece of poster paper in the middle of each table group with a narrowed guiding question that aligns to the task. Give small groups 5 min to respond to the question and each others comments in writing only (no verbal communication). After 5 min, students will rotate to another paper and comment on more responses. Keep rotations until students have seen all comments/all questions.

After silent discussion, ask students to re-read the teaching task and discuss their thoughts and opinions and refine any notes they wish or need to in their Writer's Notebook.

---

**Accomodations and Interventions:**

Sentence Frames

Give specific students longer time at each conversation

---

**SHORT CONSTRUCTED RESPONSE**

What does a strong essay look like? Use your translated rubric to evaluate several sample essays written by other students in response to the task.

---

**Pacing:** 1/2 class period (20-30 min)

---

**Scoring Guide: work meets expectations if:**

Students participate in discussion and write their explanations for scoring samples on a piece of paper to be turned in as an exit slip. Written explanations must include:

- The score they would give the essay.
  - Rubric categories that were strengths and rubric categories that were weaknesses for the author.
  - 2 sentences that give guidance as to how the author could improve the essay.
- 

**Teaching Strategies:**

Students will deconstruct and evaluate a sample essay for this same task using the translated rubric. Students will independently record their score and response to the expectations above. Students will also have a class discussion (partners first then whole class) to share their feedback.

---

**Accomodations and Interventions:**

Ask some students to focus on fewer rubric components such as Reading/Research and Controlling Idea.

Advanced Students: Complete an exit slip in which they explain the difference between selected categories (Focus vs. Development) or highlight the change in demands between each level of the rubric.

---

---

## *Writing Process*

**ESTABLISHING A CLAIM:** Ability to establish a formal claim in response to the task. WH 11-12.1

---

### **SHORT CONSTRUCTED RESPONSE**

- Read sample thesis statements and discuss strengths and weaknesses with a partner.
- Write a formal claim in your Writer's Notebook.

---

**Pacing:** 1 class period.

---

### **Scoring Guide: work meets expectations if:**

Writes a formal claim that establishes an argument and identifies key points that support development.

---

### **Teaching Strategies:**

Before students write their formal claim, review qualities of a strong claim as a class: must be an argument, include simple defense of the argument, and include categories to lead reader and organize essay.

In pairs, students will edit sample claim statements provided by the teacher. As a class, go over each thesis statement, asking for volunteers to identify the strong and weak characteristics of each statement.

Students will have 15 minutes to write a draft of their claim statement. When finished, in pairs, students will share their claim statements and give each other feedback using sticky notes instead of verbal feedback.

---

### **Accommodations and Interventions:**

Provide students with sentence frames to help write the claim. For example: A \_\_\_\_\_ economic system is the ideal system because it provides a country with \_\_\_\_\_ and \_\_\_\_\_ (choose two "goals" from your notes).

Advanced Students: Require a complex, multi-sentence thesis statement that includes a counterclaim.

---

---

**OUTLINE:** Ability to create a logical organization of main points and evidence in an outline format. WH 11-12.1

---

### **OUTLINE**

Using the organizer in your Writer's Notebook, create an outline for your essay that includes topic sentences and major evidence or key points to support the claim of each paragraph.

---

**Pacing:** 1 class (55 min)

---

**Scoring Guide: work meets expectations if:**

- Outline is logical and all pieces of the outline organizer are complete.
- 

**Teaching Strategies:**

- Review the qualities of a strong opening paragraph: HOTT- Hook, Overview, Thesis, Transition
  - Students independently write an outline using the template in their Writer's Notebook.
  - In small groups, students share their outlines for feedback.
- 

**Accommodations and Interventions:**

Students will focus on providing evidence from only one or two texts in their outline. Advanced Students: After they have completed their outline, use advanced students as peer tutors during this class to ensure other students have a strong claim and outline before beginning their rough drafts.

---

**DEVELOPMENT:** Ability to: \* Write arguments to support claims and address counterclaims in an analysis of the topic/texts using valid reasoning and relevant and sufficient evidence. WH 11-12.1 \* Produce clear and coherent writing in which the development, organization, and style are appropriate to task, purpose, and audience. WH 11-12.4 \* Write routinely over an extended time frame. WH 11-12.10

**LONG CONSTRUCTED RESPONSE**

Write a rough draft of your essay consisting of at least 5 paragraphs. A sample format would include an introduction, 3 body paragraphs (one addressing the counterclaim) and a conclusion.

---

**Pacing:** 2-3 class periods

---

**Scoring Guide: work meets expectations if:**

- Student develops ideas with relevant details and evidence, has appropriate word-usage and phrasing, and creates smooth transitions between sentences and paragraphs.
  - Paragraphs are organized in an appropriate manner
-

**Teaching Strategies:**

Day 1 - Model the construction of a model body paragraph using TEST – Topic sentence, Evidence, Significance, and Transition. Give students the rest of the class period to work independently.

Day 2 - Create stations where students can get guidance on certain aspects of the essay: introduction, claim, evidence/analysis, transitions, and conclusion. Assign a strong student-writer at each station to help guide discussion and provide peer-review. Teacher spends time at each station assisting students.

Day - 3 - Independent work time.

---

**Accommodations and Interventions:**

Teacher leads “station” for students who need extra support in developing the essay. Advanced Students: They will be the station leaders. It is essential to provide the station leaders with some instruction on how to effectively support other students prior to the activity.

---

---

**REVISION & EDITING:** Ability to develop and strengthen writing as needed by planning, revising, editing, rewriting, or trying a new approach. WH 11-12.5

---

**LONG CONSTRUCTED RESPONSE**

Use the peer review form in your Writer's Notebook to provide feedback on your classmates essays.

Use the feedback you received to revise your essay.

---

**Pacing:** 1 class period (55 min)

---

**Scoring Guide: work meets expectations if:**

Provides appropriate feedback to partner (completes the feedback form).

Uses feedback to improve rough draft.

---

**Teaching Strategies:**

Students give each other feedback on rough drafts using the “peer review template”. Students can email essays to teacher for basic feedback.

Review strategies for citing information using the Writer's Notebook – MLA citation methods, quoting, paraphrasing.

---

**Notes:**

These students already have experience/instruction for implementing MLA citations.

---

**Accommodations and Interventions:**

Assign partners carefully to make sure adequate/appropriate feedback is given.

Have some students do a peer feedback template for a sample essay instead of a classmate and teacher provides feedback for them.

Advanced Students: They should use additional peer review templates to provide feedback to multiple students.

---

---

**COMPLETION:** Ability to submit final piece that meets expectations.

---

**LONG CONSTRUCTED RESPONSE**

Turn in your final draft.

---

**Pacing:** Weekend

---

**Scoring Guide: work meets expectations if:**

Fits the “Meets Expectations” category in the rubric for the teaching task.

---

**Notes:**

- \*\* Essay always due on a Monday, allowing students to have a weekend to apply peer feedback and revise essay for final turn in.
-

## Resources

### *Uploaded Files*

 [WritersNotebook-EconThiebes.pdf](#)

([http://literacybytechnology.s3.amazonaws.com/teacherresourceuploads/93/1101720299\\_Jul\\_09\\_2012\\_162530903.pdf](http://literacybytechnology.s3.amazonaws.com/teacherresourceuploads/93/1101720299_Jul_09_2012_162530903.pdf))

Writer's Notebook to be used with instruction for Economic Systems Module.

---

### *Keywords*

 Market Economy

---

 Command Economy

---

 Capitalism

---

 Communism

---

 Democratic Socialism

---

 Freedom

---

 Security

---

 Equity

---

 Equality

---

 Free Market

---

 Public Goods

---

 Private Goods

---

 Taxes

---

### *Links\**

 ["Should the U.S. have a National Healthcare System?" \(1310L\)](#)

(<http://teacher.scholastic.com/scholasticnews/indepth/upfront/index.asp>)

John Edwards and Michael Tanner, "Should the U.S. have a National Healthcare System?"

(Article)

---

 ["Denmark Thrives Despite High Taxes" \(830L\)](#)

(<http://www.npr.org/templates/story/story.php?storyId=123126942>)

David Kestenbaum, "Denmark Thrives Despite High Taxes." National Public Radio, All Things Considered (transcript of broadcast) Although the lexile level is low, there are several content-specific vocabulary words that makes qualitative lexile measure slightly higher. It also provides ELL students opportunities to excel in text analysis as they can both listen to and read the text.

---

 ["As Cuba gives Capitalism a try, Experts Ponder the Future." \(N/A\)](#)

(<http://www.washingtonpost.com/wp-dyn/content/article/2010/09/16/AR2010091607381.html>)

William Booth, "As Cuba gives Capitalism a try, Experts Ponder the Future." Washington Post. This article has a quantitative lexile measure of 1390 and a high qualitative measure as well (challenging vocabulary and economic concepts).

---

 ["Wal-Mart: Good or Evil." \(1310L\)](#)

(<http://teacher.scholastic.com/scholasticnews/indepth/upfront/index.asp>)

Paul Krugman and John Tierney, "Wal-Mart: Good or Evil." New York Times Upfront Magazine (article)

---

 ["The World's Best Countries" \(N/A\)](#)

(<http://www.newsweek.com/2010/08/15/interactive-infographic-of-the-worlds-best-countries.html>)

"The World's Best Countries" Newsweek Magazine Online (interactive infographic). This resource is an interactive infographic that organizes economic, political, and social data from countries around the world and assess their rating based on a set criteria.

---

 ["Should the Government Tax Your Coke" \(1310L\)](#)

(<http://teacher.scholastic.com/scholasticnews/indepth/upfront/index.asp>)

William Neuman, "Should the Government Tax Your Coke" New York Times Upfront Magazine (article)

---

 ["Start-Ups, Not Bailouts." \(N/A\)](#)

([http://www.nytimes.com/2010/04/04/opinion/04friedman.html?\\_r=1&scp=1&sq=Start-Ups,%20Not%20B](http://www.nytimes.com/2010/04/04/opinion/04friedman.html?_r=1&scp=1&sq=Start-Ups,%20Not%20B);

Thomas Friedman, "Start-Ups, Not Bailouts." New York Times (article). This article has a quantitative lexile measure of 1130. This measure is also accurate as a qualitative measure.

---

\* These Lexile measures were computed automatically and did not undergo human review. They are not certified measures and should not be published or recorded in any way.

---

*Other Resources*

### Section 4: What Results?

Classroom Assessment Rubric	
<b>Not Yet</b>	
<b>Focus</b>	Attempts to address prompt but lacks focus or is off-task.
<b>Reading/Research</b>	Demonstrates weak use of reading material to develop argument.
<b>Controlling Idea</b>	Establishes a claim and attempts to support an argument but is not convincing; (L2) Attempts to acknowledge competing arguments.
<b>Development</b>	Reasoning is not clear; examples or explanations are weak or irrelevant. (L3) Connection is weak or not relevant.
<b>Organization</b>	Provides an ineffective structure; composition does not address requirements of the prompt.
<b>Conventions</b>	Demonstrates a weak command of standard English conventions; lacks cohesion; language and tone are not appropriate to audience and purpose.
<b>Meets Expectations</b>	
<b>Focus</b>	Addresses the prompt and stays on task; provides a generally convincing response.
<b>Reading/Research</b>	Demonstrates generally effective use of reading material to develop an argument.
<b>Controlling Idea</b>	Establishes a credible claim and supports an argument that is logical and generally convincing. (L2) Acknowledges competing arguments while defending the claim.
<b>Development</b>	Develops reasoning to support claim; provides evidence from text(s) in the form of examples or explanations relevant to the argument (L3) Makes a relevant connection(s) that supports argument.
<b>Organization</b>	Applies an appropriate text structure to address specific requirements of the prompt.
<b>Conventions</b>	Demonstrates a command of standard English conventions and cohesion; employs language and tone appropriate to audience and purpose.

### Classroom Assessment Task

No Classroom Assessment Task for this module

### Exemplar Work

*Uploaded Files*



*Comments*

Author Notes

Other Comments